Salafi Lords Destroy Christian Priests

-@akhbariorman & @ykmsx3

بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

Preface

اشهد ان لا اله الا الله، واشهد ان محمدا رسول الله، واشهد ان عليا ولي الله

اللهم صل على محمد وآل محمد

Throughout history, the followers of the Ahlulbayt (peace be upon them) have faced numerous misconceptions and misrepresentations. Many of these misunderstandings stem from misinformation, historical bias, or a lack of proper dialogue. The purpose of this document is to provide a well-reasoned, evidence-based refutation of the most common arguments raised against the Shia school of thought.

Rather than engaging in sectarian disputes, this work aims to clarify key theological and historical points using the Qur'an, authentic hadith sources, and the accounts of respected scholars. By addressing these arguments with logic, fairness, and respect, this document seeks to promote a deeper understanding of Shiism and encourage meaningful discussion.

My colleague and I hope that this effort will serve as a valuable resource for those seeking the truth, whether they are Shia, Sunni, or simply curious about Islamic history and doctrine. True knowledge leads to unity, and by dispelling misconceptions, we can foster mutual respect and appreciation for our diverse traditions.

May Allah (SWT) guide us all to the path of knowledge and righteousness.

Argument 1: Jaziri رحمه الله "Claims" Allah Has A Private Part..... 4
Argument 2: The Imams AS Were Racist..... 7
Argument 3: Imam Ali Named His Children After The First Three..... 12
Argument 4: Earth On a Whale..... 14
Argument 5: Donkey Narrates A Hadith..... 16
Argument 6: Imam Ali Mosquito..... 18
Argument 7: Shia Quran Has 17,000 Verses..... 20
Argument 8: Imam Ridha White Lips..... 23
Argument 9: Abu Bakr and Umar Buried Next To Muhammad ﷺ..... 24
Argument 10: Zurarah RA Cursed By Imam Jafar AS..... 26
Argument 11: Imam Ali AS Two Years Younger Than Allah SWT..... 28
Argument 12: Surah Al-Fath Refutes Infallibilty Of Prophet Muhammad ﷺ..... 29
Argument 13: Allah Created Adam In His Image..... 31
Argument 14: Abu Bakr and Umar Compared To Prophets..... 32
Argument 15: Allah SWT Places Hand On Imam Hussein AS..... 33
Argument 16: Allah SWT Stregthened Islam With Umar..... 34
Argument 17: Allah SWT Visits Imam Hussein On Fridays..... 35
Argument 18: Prophet Fobrade Mutah At Khaybar..... 36
Argument 19: Salman RA Entering Upon Fatima AS..... 37
Argument 20: Shia Prophet Was Bewitched..... 39

Argument 1: Jaziri رحمه الله "Claims" Allah Has A Private Part

Argument:

قال بعضهم - على ما حكاه ابن أبي الحديد - : سألت معاد العنبري ، فقلت :ألله وجه ؟ فقال : نعم حتى عددت جميع الأعضاء من أنف وفم وصدر وبطن ، **واستحييت أن أذكر الفرج ، فأومأت بيدي إلى فرجي ، فقال : نعم ، فقلت : أذكرأم أنثى ؟ فقال : ذكر.**

One of them said—as narrated by Ibn Abi al-Hadid:

"I asked Mu'adh al-Anbari, 'Does he have a face?'

He replied, 'Yes,' and continued listing all the body parts, including the nose, mouth, chest, and abdomen.

I was too shy to mention the private part, so I gestured with my hand toward my own, and he said, 'Yes.'

I then asked, 'Is he male or female?'

He replied, 'Male.'" [1]

Response:

This argument is completely flawed because it is not even coming from an Imam or a credible Shia source. Instead, it is attributed to Mu'adh al-Anbari, who is a Sunni, making his opinion irrelevant in a Shia theological discussion. Citing such statements as proof of anything is misguided and only weakens the argument rather than strengthening it.

Right before the statement attributed to Mu'adh al-Anbari, Ni'matullah al-Jazairi explicitly deems corporealists (those who believe God has a physical body) as disbelievers. This is important because it highlights the contradiction in using Mu'adh's words as any sort of proof. If corporealists are considered disbelievers, then why rely on the testimony of a Sunni like Mu'adh al-Anbari, whose statement about God's physical features aligns with corporealist beliefs? This further proves that the argument is weak and inconsistent, as it uses a non-Shia source while ignoring the fact that the author rejects such views outright.

---

[1] Nur Al Barahin

Proof Mu'adh al-Anbari Was Not A Shia:

أبو حاتم الرازي حافظ، ومرة: قال: ثقة

أبو حاتم بن حبان البستي كان فقيها عالما متقنا

أبو محمد بن حزم الظاهري أحفظ من غندر وأجل

أحمد بن حنبل قرة عين في الحديث، ومرة: إليه المنتهي في التثبت بالبصرة

أحمد بن شعيب النسائي ثقة، ثبت

ابن حجر العسقلاني ثقة متقن

عمرو بن علي الفلاس ما بالبصرة ولا بالكوفة ولا الحجاز أثبت منه

محمد بن سعد كاتب الواقدي ثقة

نفطويه النحوي من الأثبات في الحديث

يحيى بن سعيد القطان ما بالبصرة ولا بالكوفة ولا الحجاز أثبت منه، ولا أبالي إذا تابعني من خالفني

يحيى بن معين ثقة

Abu Hatim al-Razi A hadith memorizer, and at another time, he said: Trustworthy.

Abu Hatim ibn Hibban al-Busti He was a knowledgeable and precise jurist.

Abu Muhammad ibn Hazm al-Zahiri He had a better memory than Gundar and was more distinguished.

Ahmad ibn Hanbal A delight to the eye in hadith, and at another time, he said: He is the ultimate authority in precision in Basra.

Ahmad ibn Shu'ayb al-Nasa'i Trustworthy and reliable.

Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani Trustworthy and precise.

Amr ibn Ali al-Fallas There is no one in Basra, Kufa, or Hijaz more reliable than him.

Muhammad ibn Sa'd, the scribe of al-Waqidi Trustworthy.

Naftawayh al-Nahwi One of the most reliable in hadith.

Yahya ibn Sa'id al-Qattan There is no one in Basra, Kufa, or Hijaz more reliable than him, and I do not care if those who oppose me agree with me.

Yahya ibn Ma'in Trustworthy.[2]

The chapter title itself makes the point clear: **"Chapter on the Fact that He, the Almighty, is Neither a Body nor a Form."** [3] This explicitly rejects any notion of corporeality in relation to God. There is no room for interpretation or argument—if the chapter is dedicated to proving that God is not a body or a form, then using anything within it to support a corporealist view is completely misguided. The title alone sets the foundation for what follows, making it illogical to claim otherwise.

[2] Mu'adh Al Anbari
[3] Nur Al Barahin Chapter Name

Argument 2: The Imams AS Were Racist

Argument:
1. Ali b. Ibrahim from Harun b. Muslim from Mas'adah b. Ziyad [1] from Abu Abdillah (a.s) who said that Amir al-Mu'mineen (a.s) said: 'Be aware of marrying the people of al-Zanj, for they are a distorted creature.'[4]

'You must not marry any of the Kurds; they are a species of Jinn from which the cover is removed.'[5]

Refute:
Let us refer to an Arabic dictionary for clarification of the word zanj, namely, William Lane's Lexicon Dictionary: Madd al-Qamus, Vol. 3, pg. 1256[6] where he states;

A **certain** nation of the blacks; **the inhabitants of the country called by us "Zanguebar,** " including the "Zingis " of Ptolemy, near the entrance of the Red Sea, and a large portion of inner Africa.

One of the duas of Imam Zayn al-Abideen (as) in **Sahifiyah al-Sajjadiyyah, pg. 129 - 130[7], Dua 27[8]** [link in duas.org] sheds some light on this:

O Allāh, send out the Muslims of every region on raids against the idolaters who face them! Reinforce them with angels in ranks from You, till the idolaters are routed by them to the end of the land, slain in Your earth or taken captive, or till they admit that You are Allāh, other than whom there is no Allāh, You alone, who hast no associate! O Allāh, include in this **Your enemies in the regions of the lands**, the Indians, the Byzantines, the Turks, the Khazars, the Abyssinians, the Nubians, **the Zanjis,** the Slavs, the Daylamites, and the rest of the idol-worshipping nations, those whose names and attributes are concealed, but whom You countest in Your cognizance and overseas through Your power!

As we can read from the above, the **Zanj were a group of polytheists who worshipped idols and stones, and they were certainly a cruel set of people. This does not mean that all people related to them are evil, because otherwise we'd need to claim the same about the Byzantines, Turks, Nubians, Slavs etc… that the Imam mentions in his dua above.** However, we all know the meaning of this is in relation to only the people at that time period and not inclusive to all people. **Thus, the group of Zanj at that time can be attributed with such harsh remarks.**

In Sunni texts

---

[4] al-Kafi, Vol. 5, Book. 3, Ch. 28, H. #1
[5] al-Kafi, Vol. 5, Book 3, Ch. 28, H. # 2
[6] Madd al-Qamus, Vol. 3, pg. 1256
[7] Sahifiyah al-Sajjadiyyah, pg. 129 - 130, Dua 27
[8] Dua

As we mentioned earlier, this same narration can also be found in the Sunni corpus. For example, Abu Na'eem al-Isbihani records in Akhbar Isbihan, Vol. 1, pg. 316;

عَنْ هِشَامِ بْنِ عُرْوَةَ ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ ، قَالَتْ : قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ : تَخَيَّرُوا لِنُطَفِكُمْ ، وَانْكِحُوا فِي الْأَكْفَاءِ ، وَإِيَّاكُمْ وَالزِّنْجَ ؛ فَإِنَّهُ خَلْقٌ مُشَوَّهٌ

Narrated by Hisham bin 'Urwah, from his father, from Aisha, who said: The Messenger of Allah (saw) said: "Choose the mate with good lineage for your offspring, and marry those who are suitable for marriage. **Beware of marrying the Zanj, for they are a distorted creation."**[9]

Tafsir Ibn Kathir, commentary of 48:16:

قال ابن أبي عمر : وجدت في مكان آخر : ابن أبي خالد عن أبيه قال : نزل علينا أبو هريرة ففسر قول رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم : " تقاتلون قومًا نعالهم الشَّعْر " قال : هم البارزون ، يعني الأكراد

Ibn Abi 'Umar said: "I found in another place: Ibn Abi Khalid narrated from his father saying: Abu Huraira came to us and explained the saying of the Messenger of Allah (saw): 'You will fight against a people with **shoes made of hair**.' He said: 'They are the prominent ones,' meaning the Kurds."

The Sunni scholar, al-Raghib al-Isfahani, records in his Kitab al-Muhadhrat, pg. 426[10]:

ذكر أن عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه روى عن النبي صلّى الله عليه وسلم أنه قال: الأكراد جيل الجن كشف عنهم الغطاء

It has been mentioned by Umar b. al-Khattab that Rasulullah (s) said: **The Kurds are a species of Jinn. The cover has been removed from them**

There is **no justification for claiming the Shi'a hold to this view**, as the **narrations are weak** for this. If our **opponents want to use weak mursal narrations against us**, then they should be **consistent and also accept this weak mursal narrations within the Sunni corpus**.

[9] Akhbar Isbihan, Vol. 1, pg. 316
[10] Kitab al-Muhadhrat, pg. 426

Racism of Umar b. al-Khattab

‘Umar Ibn al-Khattab was known to be racist, especially towards ajam (non-arabs), hence we see that he discriminated against Salman al-Muhammadi (as). These reports are not limited to Shi’a hadiths, for the same can be read from Sunni works too.

For example, in Musannaf Ibn Abi Shayba, Vol 14, pg. 409, H. # 2764[11] we read;

حدثنا وكيع عن أبي هلال عن ابن بريدة قال: (قال) عمر: ما تعلم الرجل الفارسية إلا (خب) ولا (خب) إلا نقصت مروءته

Wakee narrated from Abu Hilal that Ibn Buraydah said: Umar said, "(A man) does not learn Persian except for (deceptive) plotting, and not (for the sake of) plotting except that his courage is diminished."

Umar’s enmity to Persian people is very clear to any researcher. He was so racist in fact he refused to allow any Persian, even if he was a muslim, into Medina! Musannaf Abd Al Razzaq, Vol 5, pg. 474:[12]

عبدالرزاق عن معمر عن الزهري قال : كان عمر بن الخطاب لا يترك أحدا من العجم يدخل المدينة

Abdulrazaq – Mu’amar – Al-Zuhri said: ‘Umar bin al-Khattab didn’t allow any one of the non Arab to enter Medina.’

When someone tries to argue that this isn’t a problem, y’all should remember **that all of the authors of the six major Sunni hadith books were predominantly of Persian origin[13]**

Imam al-Bukhari: **Persian scholar** born in Bukhara (present-day Uzbekistan).

Imam Muslim (Muslim Nishapuri): **Persian scholar** born in Nishapur, Khorasan (present-day Iran).

Imam Abu Dawood: **Persian scholar** born in Sistan, Iran.

Imam al-Tirmidhi: **Persian scholar born** in Termiz (present-day Uzbekistan).

Imam al-Nasaa'i: **Persian** born in Nisa, Khorasan (present-day Turkmenistan).

Imam Ibn Maajah: Of **Persian origin**, born in Qazwin, Iran.

If Sunnis want to speak about **racism, let them first condemn Umar before they try to speak about our hadith corpus, because the Ahlulbayt (as) have made it extremely clear that this sort of behaviour is condemned and so any hadith that contradicts it and the Holy Qur’an is to be discarded.**

---

[11] Musannaf Ibn Abi Shayba, Vol 14, pg. 409, H. # 2764
[12] Musannaf Abd Al Razzaq, Vol 5, pg. 474
[13] Origin

Islamic view of racism

Islam has certainly forbidden and outlawed racism in all its shapes. Evidence for this can be found in both the Qur'an & hadiths, we shall mention a few evidences. For example, we read in Kitab al-Kafi, Vol. 8, Book. 1, Ch. 208[14]: .

Salman was seated with a number of people from Quraysh in a Mosque. They started priding over their lineages and ancestry until they reached Salman. Umar b. al-Khattab said to him, 'Inform me who you are, and who your father is, and what your origin is'.

So he said: 'I am Salman, son of a servant of Allah (swt). I had strayed but Allah (swt) had guided me through Muhammad ﷺ, and I was needy so Allah (swt) enriched through Muhammad ﷺ, and I was owned [as a slave] so Allah (swt) freed me through Muhammad ﷺ. This is my lineage, and this is my nobility'.

So Rasulullah ﷺ [came out and] said: 'O group of Quraysh, the nobility of a man is his Religion, and his chivalry is his manners, and his origin is his intellect, and Allah (swt) has said: O mankind! Indeed, We created you from a male and a female, and made you nations and tribes that you may identify yourselves with one another.' {49:13}. Then the **Prophet ﷺ said to Salman, 'There is no virtue over you from any of these ones except by taqwa (i.e., fear of Allah), and if there is piety in you [superior] to them, then you are more virtous [than them].'**

Moreover, another hadith by Imam Ali (as) recorded in al-Kafi, Vol. 8, H. 204[15] states:

'When Ali became the ruler, he ascended to the Pulpit, and praised Allah (swt) and extolled Him. Then he said, "By Allah, I will not withhold from you a single dirham of your due shares from the gains. I have been hindered in Yathrib (Medina), so let your own souls testify if you see me withholding what is rightfully yours while giving it to myself." **So Aqeel stood up and said to him, "By Allah! You will consider me equal to a black man from Medina?". So he said, "Sit down! There was no one here speaking except for you, and your virtue over others is only due to merit or piety."'**

[14] Kitab al-Kafi, Vol. 8, Book. 1, Ch. 208
[15] al-Kafi, Vol. 8, H. 204

In another hadith with a Sahih chain it states that the Prophet (saw) said from al-Kafi, Vol. 5, Book 3, Ch. 21, H. # 1[16]:

Today (we say) all people, white and black, those from Quraysh, Arab, non-Arab are all from Adam, and Adam was created by Allah from clay. The most beloved in the sight of Allah, most Majestic, most Glorious, on the Day of Judgment will be those who are most obedient to Him and most pious before Him. O Juwayabir, I do not see any of the Muslims as better than you except because of his being more pious and more obedient to Allah than you."

This message is so vital that we see in al-Kafi, Vol. 2, Book 1, Ch. 123, H. # 1 and with a different chain in H. # 2:

Imam al-Sadiq (as) said: "**Whoever discriminates or supports discrimination, he has taken off the collar of belief from his neck**."[17]

Authenticity:
(The Kurd Jinn hadith is mursal and found in sunni books) also
Regardless of the fact that all of these speak against racism, the hadith about the Zanj is also weak, even though its grading is صحيح على الظاهر, which translates to "Authentic based on its apparent meaning" or "Authentically sound on the surface." This signifies that the hadith is considered authentic according to its apparent indications, although further analysis might sometimes delve deeper into its context or chain of narration.

There are two narrators for this hadith ('Mas'ada Ibn Ziyad', while other manuscripts say 'Mas'ada Ibn Sadaqa') [Source: al-Kafi, Vol. 10, pg. 645 - 646][18]

The more reliable version says **Ibn Sadaqa** and that is because al-Tusi, who **had original reliable manuscripts of al-Kafi, quotes this same narration in his *Tahdhib al-Ahkam, Vol. 7, pg. 467 - 8*[19] with the mention of it being Ibn Sadaqa.** This is supported by the fact that al-Najashi & al-Tusi mentions he had a book on Khutbas on Imam Ali (as), this seems to be a portion from that book.

Now Ibn Sadaqa is unreliable in our corpus, there is no tawtheeq for him hence we see that the Muhaqiq of Tahdhib says in the margin that this narration is ضع (i.e. ضعيف). Al-Sayyid al-Khui' would also weaken this narration on account of there being a disconnection **between Ibn Sadaqa, who is a companion of the 5th Imam, and Harun Ibn Muslim, a companion of the 10th Imam. Perhaps this was because a book was passed down, but we have no idea about the reliability of this book due to no tranmission for it being mentioned - and thus it is declared weak.**

[16] al-Kafi, Vol. 5, Book 3, Ch. 21, H. # 1:
[17] al-Kafi, Vol. 2, Book 1, Ch. 123, H. # 1
[18] al-Kafi, Vol. 10, pg. 645 - 646
[19] Tahdhib al-Ahkam, Vol. 7, pg. 467 - 8

Another Hadith that may be used is found in Al-Khiṣāl Book 11, Chapter #16[20]:
Messenger of Allah ﷺ who said, “The following will not enter Paradise: the alcoholics, the haughty ones, the tale-bearers, **the intensely black, the pimps, the detectives, the effeminate, those who steal the shroud from the corpse, the tithers, those who disregard their relatives, and the Qadarites.’”**

If our opponents actually stopped using these garbage arguments they would have read what Saduq RA said beneath the hadith:
“The author of this book (r.a) said: "**What is meant by intensely black is the one with no gray hair on his head or beard despite his advanced age, and he is called 'al-Gharbib'**.”

If you don’t care about his words at least read what Imam Baqir عَلَيهِ السَّلام said in Al-Kāfī - Volume 2 Book 1, Chapter #111:
“In the heart of every servant (of Allah) there is a white dot. **When he commits a sin a black dot appears in the white one. If he repents the black dot goes away, but if he continues committing sins the black dot enlarges until it covers the white dot and when the white dot is covered the person thereafter does not return to good things as Allah, the Most Majestic, the Most Holy, has said, ‘In fact, their hearts are stained by their deeds.’” (83 : 14).**[21]

Now let’s turn it back on you and look at your own books.
It is mentioned in **Silsilat al-Ahadeeth al-Saheehah by Al-Albani, Volume 1, Hadith No. 49,** the text says:
(When Allah created Adam, He struck his right shoulder and brought forth white offspring like grains, and He struck his left shoulder and brought forth black offspring like charcoal. He said to those on his right: ‘To Paradise, and I do not mind,’ and to those on his left: ‘To Hell, and I do not mind.’)
Al-Albani said: “And its chain is authentic.”[22]

So if you say the blackness here refers to the blackness of the heart and soul due to excessive sins, then your argument falls apart.
But if you say it refers to skin color, then your Lord is racist and unjust.

[20] https://thaqalayn.net/hadith/10/11/16/2
[21] https://thaqalayn.net/hadith/2/1/111/20
[22] https://i.imgur.com/A31mKvG.png

Argument 3: Imam Ali Named His Children After The First Three

Argument:

“Imam Ali named his children Abu bakr,Umar, and Uthman. How could he have hated them if he named his children after them?”

Response:

وقد بلغني ترحمك عليهم واستغفارك لهم، وإنه لعلى وجهين ما لهما ثالث: إما تقية إن أنت تبرأت منهم خفت أن يتفرق عنك أهل عسكرك الذين تقاتلني بهم، أو أن الذي ادعيت باطل وكذب. وقد بلغني وجائني بذلك بعض من تثق به من خاصتك بأنك تقول لشيعتك الضالة وبطانتك بطانة السوء: **إني قد سميت ثلاثة بنين لي أبا بكر وعمر وعثمان، فإذا سمعتموني أترحم على أحد من أئمة الضلالة فإني أعني بذلك بني.**

I have been informed of your praying for mercy upon them and seeking forgiveness for them; and indeed, this can be understood in two ways, with no third option: either out of caution, for if you were to disassociate yourself from them, you would fear that the people of your army, with whom you are fighting me, would disperse, or that what you claim is false and a lie. I have also been informed, and it has reached me from someone you trust from your close circle, that you say to your misguided fol lowers and your evil entourage: '**I have named three of my sons Abu Bakr, Umar, and Uthman.' So, if you hear me praying for mercy upon any of the leaders of misguidance, I am referring to these sons.**[23]

Naming someone after a particular person doesn’t necessarily mean you like them or support their beliefs. A name is simply a designation and doesn't imply admiration or affiliation with the individual it represents. Just because someone shares a name with a prominent figure doesn't mean they align with their views or actions. **This view is also held by the most prominent Sunni scholar, Ibn Taymiyya.**

فليس في التسمية بها ما يدل على أنهم منهم، والتسمية بتلك الأسماء قد تكون فيهم فلا يدل على أن المسمى بها من أهل السنة.

“So, naming with those names does not indicate that they belong to them, and having those names among them does not mean that the one named with them is from Ahl al-Sunnah.” [24]

More Ahadith Proving They Were Not Named After The First 3:

وروي عن أمير المؤمنين (عليه السلام) أنه قال: **" إنما سميته عثمان بعثمان بن مظعون أخي ."**

It is narrated from the Commander of the Faithful (peace be upon him) that he said:

---

[23] Kitab sulaym 301 Scan Kitab Sulaym
[24] منهاج السنة

"I named him Uthman after Uthman ibn Maz'un, my brother." [25]

وذكر فيه، عن هبيرة بن مريم، قال: كنا جلوسا عند علي عليه السلام، فدعا ابنه عثمان، فقال له: يا عثمان! ثم قال: **إني لم أسمه باسم عثمان الشيخ الكافر، إنما سميته باسم عثمان بن مظعون.**

It was also narrated from Hubayrah ibn Maryam:

"We were sitting with Ali (peace be upon him) when he called his son Uthman and said to him: 'O Uthman!' Then he continued, **'I did not name him after Uthman, the old disbeliever, but rather after Uthman ibn Maz'un.'"** [26]

[25] أبصار العين في أنصار الحسين
[26] بحار الأنوار تقريب المعارف

Argument 4: Earth On a Whale

Argument:

“Shia Imam thinks that The Earth is on a whale:

مُحَمَّدٌ عَنْ أَحْمَدَ عَنِ ابْنِ مَحْبُوبٍ عَنْ جَمِيلِ بْنِ صَالِحٍ عَنْ أَبَانِ بْنِ تَغْلِبَ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) قَالَ سَأَلْتُهُ عَنِ الْأَرْضِ عَلَى أَيِّ شَيْءٍ هِيَ قَالَ هِيَ عَلَى حُوتٍ قُلْتُ فَالْحُوتُ عَلَى أَيِّ شَيْءٍ هُوَ قَالَ عَلَى الْمَاءِ قُلْتُ فَالْمَاءُ عَلَى أَيِّ شَيْءٍ هُوَ قَالَ عَلَى صَخْرَةٍ قُلْتُ فَعَلَى أَيِّ شَيْءٍ الصَّخْرَةُ قَالَ عَلَى قَرْنِ ثَوْرٍ أَمْلَسَ قُلْتُ فَعَلَى أَيِّ شَيْءٍ الثَّوْرُ قَالَ عَلَى الثَّرَى قُلْتُ فَعَلَى أَيِّ شَيْءٍ الثَّرَى فَقَالَ هَيْهَاتَ عِنْدَ ذَلِكَ ضَلَّ عِلْمُ الْعُلَمَاءِ .

Muhammad, from Ahmad, from Ibn Mahboub, from Jameel Bin Saleh, from Aban Bin Tabligh has narrated the following: Abu Abdullah said, ‘I asked him about the earth, which thing does it rest upon? He said: ‘It is upon the whale’. I said, ‘So the whale, which thing does it rest upon?’ He said: ‘Upon the water’. I said, ‘So the water, upon which thing does is rest upon?’ He said: ‘Upon a rock’. I said, ‘So upon which thing does the rock rest upon?’ He said: ‘Upon the horns of a bull’ I said, ‘So upon which thing does the bull rest upon?’ He said: ‘Upon the mist’. I said, ‘So upon which thing does the mist rest upon?’ He said: ‘This is how far knowledge of scholars is permitted (to reveal) and beyond this is straying’.”

Response:

It is hypocritical for Sunnis to mock Shias for believing that the earth rests on a whale when the same concept is present in their own hadith literature. The narration about the earth being supported by the great fish, often referred to as "Nun," is found in both Sunni and Shia sources. For example, the hadith from Ibn Abbas, which mentions the earth being spread on the back of the "Nun," is cited in Sunni collections .Therefore, mocking Shia beliefs on this matter while disregarding similar traditions within their own sources is inconsistent and shows a double standard. Both Sunni and Shia scholars have recorded similar accounts, so this idea should be acknowledged with respect rather than derision.

حدثنا محمد بن المثنى ، قال : ثنا ابن أبي عدى ، عن شعبة ، عن سليمان ، عن أبي ظبيان ، عن ابن عباس ، قال : أوَّلُ ما خلق الله من شيء القلم ، فجرى بما هو كائن ، ثم رفع بخار الماء ، فخُلقت منه السماوات ، ثم خُلِقَ النُّونُ ، فَبُسِطَتِ الأرض على ظهر النون ، فتحرك النون ، فمادت الأرض ، فأثْبتت بالجبال ، فإن الجبال لتَفْخَرُ على الأرض . قال : وقرأ : نَ وَالْقَلَمِ وَمَا يَسْطُرُونَ

Muhammad ibn al-Muthanna narrated to us, he said: Ibn Abi 'Udaya narrated to us, from Shu'bah, from Sulayman, from Abu Dhubayan, from Ibn Abbas, who said: The first thing that Allah created was the pen, and it wrote what would happen. Then, the steam of water rose, from which the heavens were created. Then the "Nun" (the great fish) was created, and the earth was spread on its back. When the "Nun" moved, the earth began to shake, so the mountains were placed to stabilize it. The mountains then boast over the earth. He recited: **"Nun, by the pen and what they inscribe."** (Surah Al-Qalam, 68:1) [27]

All the **narrators can be found in Sahih Bukhari[28] (I'll link to a Rijal book that proves it in the footnote), so there is no way to doubt the authenticity of this report, and when it comes to the**

[27] Tafsir Tabari
[28] Authentication of Narrators

fact that Ibn Abbas is not the Prophet ﷺ, you all seem to forget that the Prophet said in Sahih al-Bukhari 3756: Narrated Ibn `Abbas:

Once the Prophet (ﷺ) embraced me and said: "O Allah, **teach him wisdom (i.e. understanding the knowledge of the Qur'an).**[29]

[29] Sahih al-Bukhari 3756

Argument 5: Donkey Narrates A Hadith

Argument:

وَرُوِيَ أَنَّ أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ قَالَ إِنَّ ذَلِكَ الْحِمَارَ كَلَّمَ رَسُولَ الله ﷺ فَقَالَ بِأَبِي أَنْتَ وَأُمِّي إِنَّ أَبِي حَدَّثَنِي عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ جَدِّهِ عَنْ أَبِيهِ أَنَّهُ كَانَ مَعَ نُوحٍ فِي السَّفِينَةِ فَقَامَ إِلَيْهِ نُوحٌ فَمَسَحَ عَلَى كَفَلِهِ ثُمَّ قَالَ يَخْرُجُ مِنْ صُلْبِ هَذَا الْحِمَارِ حِمَارٌ يَرْكَبُهُ سَيِّدُ النَّبِيِّينَ وَخَاتَمُهُمْ فَالْحَمْدُ لله الَّذِي جَعَلَنِي ذَلِكَ الْحِمَارَ.

It is narrated that Amir al-Mu'minin said, "Indeed, this donkey spoke to the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and said: 'May my father and mother be sacrificed for you! My father told me from his father, from his grandfather, from his father, that he was with Noah on the ark. Noah came to him, placed his hand on his back, and then said: 'From the back of this donkey will come a donkey that will be ridden by the master of the prophets and the seal of them.' Praise be to Allah who made me that donkey.'" [30]

Response:

The donkey mentioned in the narration is not part of the chain of hadith (isnad), but rather appears in the body of the narration (matn). This distinction is important because the isnad, which includes the chain of transmitters, holds the key to the authenticity of a hadith. The matn, however, refers to the actual content or text of the hadith, and in this case, the story of the donkey is presented as part of the content, not the chain of narrators. This suggests that the focus is on the narrative itself rather than the reliability of the chain of transmission, which raises questions about the authenticity of the story.

The Hadith has also been graded weak by Allama Majlisi

الحديث التاسع : ضعيف وآخره مرسل.

The ninth hadith: Weak, and its ending is mursal. [31]

It is hypocritical for Sunnis to mock Shias for having talking animals in their hadiths when they themselves have similar stories in their tradition. Both Sunni and Shia sources contain narrations where animals. Therefore, mocking Shia hadiths involving talking animals while ignoring or downplaying the presence of similar stories in their own tradition is not only inconsistent but also reflects a double standard. If one tradition is criticized for such narratives, the other should be held to the same scrutiny, and this selective criticism undermines the fairness of the argument.

We can see animals speaking in sunni ahadith, such as the following:

أتى النبي ﷺ وهو بخيبر حمار أسود، فوقف بين يديه فقال من أنت؟ فقال : أنا عمرو بن فلان كنا سبعة أخوة كلنا ركبنا الأنبياء وأنا أصغرهم، وكنت لك، فملكني رجل من اليهود، فكنت إذ ذكرتك كبأت به فيوجعني ضرباً فقال النبي ﷺ فأنت يَعْفُور.

The Prophet (ﷺ) was at Khaybar when a black donkey came to him, stood in front of him, and said, "Who are you?" **The donkey replied, "I am Amr ibn so-and-so. We were seven brothers, and we**

[30] Donkey Hadith
[31] Mirat Al Uqool

all served the prophets. I am the youngest of them, and I belonged to you. But a man from the Jews owned me, and whenever I remembered you, he would beat me, causing me pain." The Prophet (ﷺ) then said, "So you are Ya'fur." [32]

There also various other animals speaking in sunni ahadith like a cow;

عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ ـ رضى الله عنه ـ عَنِ النَّبِيِّ صلى الله عليه وسلم قَالَ " بَيْنَمَا رَجُلٌ رَاكِبٌ عَلَى بَقَرَةٍ الْتَفَتَتْ إِلَيْهِ. فَقَالَتْ لَمْ أُخْلَقْ لِهَذَا، خُلِقْتُ لِلْحِرَاثَةِ، قَالَ آمَنْتُ بِهِ أَنَا وَأَبُو بَكْرٍ وَعُمَرُ، وَأَخَذَ الذِّئْبُ شَاةً فَتَبِعَهَا الرَّاعِي، فَقَالَ الذِّئْبُ مَنْ لَهَا يَوْمَ السَّبُعِ، يَوْمَ لاَ رَاعِيَ لَهَا غَيْرِي. قَالَ آمَنْتُ بِهِ أَنَا وَأَبُو بَكْرٍ وَعُمَرُ

Narrated Abu Huraira:

The Prophet (ﷺ) said, "While a man was **riding a cow, it turned towards him and said, 'I have not been created for this purpose (i.e. carrying)...**[33]

Even **trees** are speaking in their most authentic ahadith:

عَنْ مَعْنٍ، قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَبِي قَالَ، سَأَلْتُ مَسْرُوقًا مَنْ آذَنَ النَّبِيَّ صلى الله عليه وسلم بِالْجِنِّ لَيْلَةَ اسْتَمَعُوا الْقُرْآنَ فَقَالَ حَدَّثَنِي أَبُوكَ ـ يَعْنِي ابْنَ مَسْعُودٍ ـ أَنَّهُ آذَنَتْهُ بِهِمْ شَجَرَةٌ .

Ma'n reported.. I heard it from my father who said:

I asked Masruq who informed the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) about the night when they heard the Qur'an. He said: Your father, **Ibn Mas'ud, narrated it to me that a tree informed him about that.**[34]

بْنِ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ، قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَبِي قَالَ، سَأَلْتُ مَسْرُوقًا مَنْ آذَنَ النَّبِيَّ صلى الله عليه وسلم بِالْجِنِّ لَيْلَةَ اسْتَمَعُوا الْقُرْآنَ. فَقَالَ حَدَّثَنِي أَبُوكَ ـ يَعْنِي عَبْدَ اللَّهِ ـ أَنَّهُ آذَنَتْ بِهِمْ شَجَرَةٌ.

Narrated `Abdur-Rahman:

"I asked Masruq, 'Who informed the Prophet (ﷺ) about the Jinns at the night when they heard the Qur'an?' He said, 'Your father `**Abdullah informed me that a tree informed the Prophet (ﷺ) about them.' "**[35]

---

[32] Donkey Khaybar
[33] Sahih al-Bukhari 2324
[34] Sahih Muslim 450e
[35] Sahih al-Bukhari 3859

Argument 6: Imam Ali Mosquito

Argument:
“Imam Ali is a mosquito in Shia Ahadith”

Response:

فقيل للباقر عليه السلام: فان بعض من ينتحل موالاتكم يزعم أن البعوضة علي عليه السلام وأن ما فوقها - وهو الذباب - محمد رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله. فقال الباقر عليه السلام: سمع هؤلاء شيئا [و] لم يضعوه على وجهه. إنما كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله قاعدا ذات يوم هو وعلي عليه السلام إذ سمع قائلا يقول: ما شاء الله وشاء محمد، وسمع آخر يقول: ما شاء الله، وشاء علي. فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: لا تقرنوا محمدا و [لا] عليا بالله عز وجل ولكن قولوا: ما شاء الله ثم [شاء محمد ما شاء الله ثم] (2) شاء علي. إن مشية الله هي القاهرة التي لا تساوى، ولا تكافأ ولا تدانى. وما محمد رسول الله في [دين] (3) الله وفي قدرته إلا كذبابة تطير في هذه الممالك الواسعة. وما علي عليه السلام في [دين] الله وفي قدرته إلا كبعوضة في جملة هذه الممالك.

It was said to Al-Baqir, peace be upon him: Some of those who claim your muwalat claim that the mosquito is Ali, peace be upon him, and that what is above it - which is the fly - is Muhammad the Messenger of God peace be upon him him and his family. Al-Baqir, peace be upon him, said: These people heard something [and] did not put it on its face. Rather, the Messenger of God, peace be upon him and his family, was sitting one day, he and Ali, peace be upon him, when he heard someone saying: What God willed and Muhammad willed, and another saying: What God willed, and Ali willed. The Messenger of God peace be upon him and his family, said: Do not associate Muhammad nor Ali with God Almighty, but say: What God wills, then [Muhammad wills, what God wills, then] (2) Ali wills. The will of Allah is the force that cannot be compared, does not have a match nor under valued. And Muhammad is the Messenger of God in the [religion] (3) of God and in his power but a fly that flies in these vast kingdoms. And Ali, peace be upon him, is not in the [religion] of God and in His power except as a mosquito among these kingdoms.[36]

Our opponents insult Sayeda Fatimah (peace be upon her) by referring to her as a mosquito in their hadiths.

There is a long hadith in which RasulAllah (ﷺ) tells Imam Hassan (ع) and Imam Hussain (ع): "Go to the **eye of the mosquito**." In the explanation (written in blue of the scan), it is stated that the mosquito was Sayeda Fatimah.[37] https://i.imgur.com/6yEVUeW.png

Another Hasan hadith where RasulAllah (ﷺ) said Fatima is a mosquito[38]
https://i.imgur.com/VBy74S4.png

[36] Tafsir Al Askari Scan Tafsir Al Askari
[37] https://i.imgur.com/6yEVUeW.png
[38] https://i.imgur.com/VBy74S4.png

Linguist Al-Zubaydi says:
https://i.imgur.com/welSdFK.png
(Al-Baqqa: "The Mosquito")

[Taj Al-‘Arus by Al-Zubaydi, Volume 25, Page 89][39]

There is also a good video that goes into more detail on the subject:

Debunking Al Kufr Productions: Imam Ali (AS) is a Mosquito?

[39] https://imgur.com/welSdFK

Argument 7: Shia Quran Has 17,000 Verses

Argument:

عَلِيُّ بْنُ الْحَكَمِ عَنْ هِشَامِ بْنِ سَالِمٍ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ الله (علَيهِ السَّلام) قَالَ إِنَّ الْقُرْآنَ الَّذِي جَاءَ بِهِ جَبْرَئِيلُ (عَلَيهِ السَّلام) إِلَى مُحَمَّدٍ (صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وآلِه) سَبْعَةَ عَشَرَ أَلْفَ آيَةٍ.

28. Ali ibn al-Hakam has narrated from Hisham ibn Salim from Abu ‘Abdillah who said: “The Quran that Jibril brought to Muhammad ﷺ had seventeen thousand verses.” [40]

Response:

Al-Fayḍ al-Kāshānī records the hadith differently in his book:

(الكافي - ٢:٦٣٤) علي بن الحكم، عن هشام بن سالم، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام **قال إن القرآن الذي جاء به جبرئيل عليه السلام على محمد صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم سبعة آلاف آية**

‘Alī ibn al-Ḥakam narrated from Hishām ibn Sālim, who narrated from **Abū ‘Abdullāh (peace be upon him)**, who said:

"The Qur’an that Jibrīl (peace be upon him) brought to Muhammad (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) consisted of seven thousand verses."

“It is commonly known among people today that the Qur’an consists of 6,666 verses.

However, Al-Ṭabarsī (may Allah have mercy on him) narrated in his *Tafsīr*, *Majma‘ al-Bayān*, from the Prophet (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) that the Qur’an consists of 6,203 verses.

Alternatively, the difference may arise from variations in how the verses are counted or from verses whose recitation was abrogated.”[41]

Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī ibn Bābawayh al-Qummī (Shaykh al-Ṣadūq) explains the 17000 version as well:

ما ذكره الصدوق الله هنا، بيان للمراد من القرآن المذكور في هذا الحديث، فهو ما يشمل القرآن، وما نزل من الوحي الذي ليس بقرآن، المعبر عنه بالحديث القدسي.

What **Al-Ṣadūq** (may Allah have mercy on him) mentioned here is an explanation of the intended meaning of the "Qur’an" in this hadith. It refers to **both the Qur’an itself and the revelation that is not part of the Qur’an**, which is known as **ḥadīth qudsī (sacred narration)**. [42]

---

[40] Al Kafi
[41] Fayd Al Kashani
[42] Saduq's Explanation

When it comes to the authenticity of the report in Al-Kafi that mentions 17,000 verses, it is da'if because there is a very weak narrator in the chain. Our scholars did not notice this due to the presence of another narrator with the same name. Here's the detailed refute:

Investigating the Ḥadīth's reliability

Now the chain quoted here is not the full one, as there's ta'liq (summarizing) in the chain. In the hadith just before it, we find the full chain; H. # 27. So that makes the full chain the following;

(مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ الْحَكَمِ عَنْ هِشَامِ بْنِ سَالِمٍ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ الله (علَيهِ السَّلام.

Muhammad Ibn Yahya from Ahmad Ibn Muhammad from Ali Ibn al-Hakam from Hisham Ibn Salim from Abi 'Abdillah (as).

At first glance, this chain seems authentic as all the narrators are well-known here, except that it is falsely assumed that Ahmad Ibn Muhammad is Ibn 'Isa, who is a well-known reliable narrator. However, upon further investigation we can prove it to be a different narrator with the same name - **Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Sayyar (known as al-Sayyari).**

Firstly, by referring back to Fehrist al-Tusi, pg. 66[43] We find that: Muhammad Ibn Yahya (al-Attar) used to narrate from Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Sayyar and that he had a book titled 'Kitab al-Qira'at. Al-Shaykh al-Najashi also mentioned this in his Rijal al-Najashi, pg. 429 - 430, Bio. # 192. [44]

Both scholars considered him weak in hadith and associated him with the **ghulat**, and Ibn al-Ghada'iri likewise did too in his Kitab al-Dhu'afa, Book 2, Bio. # 11[45]. Al-Najashi further mentions that Ibn al-Walid al-Qummi (رحمه الله) considered him from amongst the narrators that he weakened, and al-Shaykh al-Saduq (رحمه الله) followed him alongside in that opinion in Rijal al-Najashi, pg. 348, Bio. # 939[46] under the tarjama of Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Ibn Yahya.

[43] Fehrist al-Tusi, pg. 66
[44] Rijal al-Najashi, pg. 429 - 430, Bio. # 192
[45] Kitab al-Dhu'afa, Book 2, Bio. # 11
[46] Rijal al-Najashi, pg. 348, Bio. # 939

In a hadith recorded in Rijal al-Kashi, pg. 315, Bio. # 407[47] it is attributed to what it says Imam al-Jawad (as), but Allama al-Tustari (رحمه الله) says this is a mistake and should actually says Imam al-Askari (as):

قال: قرأت في رقعة مع الجواد عليه السلام، يعلم من سأل عن السياري، انه ليس في المكان الذي ادعاه لنفسه، وألا تدفعوا إليه شيئا.

He (the narrator) said: I read in a document with Imam Al-Jawad (as), that he informed those who asked about **Al-Sayyari**, that he was not in the place he claimed to be **and not to give him anything**.

So this narrator is most certainly an unreliable hadith transmitter, and likely a liar as his status was very low. Now, we must note that the uniqueness of the Shi'a hadith corpus to the Jewish, Chrsitian and Sunni corpus is that our sources were passed down via writings & books rather than being orally transmitted. So when al-Kulayni (قدس الله روحه) quotes a narrator, it is likely he is quoting his book and not directly hearing it from the person.

Fortunately, we have this book preserved today, and when we read through the book **we find the same narration on Sayyari's Kitab al-Qira'at, H. # 16, pg. 9.[48] It is the same exact chain and same exact content, making it certain that the narrator here is Ibn Sayyar and not Ibn 'Isa, as commonly assumed.**

[47] Rijal al-Kashi, pg. 315, Bio. # 407
[48] Kitab al-Qira'at, H. # 16, pg. 9

Argument 8: Imam Ridha White Lips

Argument:

فَدَخَلَ وَأَمَرَنِي بِالدُّخُولِ مَعَهُ فَلَمَّا نَظَرَ إِلَيْهِ الرِّضَا وَثَبَ إِلَيْهِ فَعَانَقَهُ وَضَمَّهُ إِلَى صَدْرِهِ وَقَبَّلَ مَا بَيْنَ عَيْنَيْهِ ثُمَّ سَحَبَهُ سَحْباً فِي فِرَاشِهِ وَأَكَبَّ عَلَيْهِ مُحَمَّد بْنُ عَلِي يُقَبِّلُهُ وَيُسَارُّهُ بِشَيْءٍ لَمْ أَفْهَمْهُ وَرَأَيْتُ فِي شَفَتَيِ الرِّضَا زُبْداً أَشَدَّ بَيَاضاً مِنَ الثَّلْجِ وَرَأَيْتُ أَبَا جَعْفَرٍ يَلْحَسُهُ بِلِسَانِهِ.ثُمَّ أَدْخَلَ يَدَهُ بَيْنَ ثَوْبَيْهِ وَصَدْرِهِ فَاسْتَخْرَجَ مِنْهُ شَيْئاً شَبِيهاً بِالْعُصْفُورِ فَابْتَلَعَهُ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ وَمَضَى الرِّضَا

Then he entered and ordered me to follow him. When he looked at Imam al-Ridha (peace be upon him), the Imam leapt towards him, embraced him, held him to his chest, and kissed between his eyes**. Then, he gently pulled him in his bed and Muhammad ibn Ali (peace be upon him) began kissing him and whispering something into his ear that I could not understand. I saw on the lips of Imam al-Ridha (peace be upon him) a froth that was whiter than snow. I saw Abu Ja'far (peace be upon him) licking it with his tongue.** Then, he put his hand between his garments and chest and took something out of him, which looked like a small bird. Abu Ja'far (peace be upon him) swallowed it.

Response:

Some people, due to a lack of knowledge or due to misinterpretation, might mock or misunderstand certain passages. Some might make inappropriate or baseless assumptions, such as claiming that the white froth on Imam al-Ridha's (peace be upon him) lips is sperm. This kind of interpretation is not only disrespectful but also distorts the sacred and spiritual nature of the event. Only dirty minded and porn infested minds would think of such a thing.

The white substance on his lips was not sperm, but rather the Imam's blood:

عِدَّةٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ خَالِدٍ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ مُحَمَّد بْن سِنَانٍ عَنِ الْحَسَنِ الصَّيْقَلِ قَالَ قَالَ لِي أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) تُرِيدُ أُرِيكَ قَمِيصَ عَلِيٍّ (عليه السلام) الَّذِي ضُرِبَ فِيهِ وَ أُرِيكَ دَمَهُ قَالَ قُلْتُ نَعَمْ فَدَعَا بِهِ وَ هُوَ فِي سَفَطٍ فَأَخْرَجَهُ وَ نَشَرَهُ فَإِذَا هُوَ قَمِيصُ كَرَابِيسَ يُشْبِهُ السُّنْبُلانِي فإذا موضع الجيب إلى الأرض و إذا الدم أبيض شبه اللبن شبه شطب السيف قال هذا قميص علي (عليه السلام) الذي ضرب فيه و هذا أثر دمه فشبرت بدنه فإذا هو ثلاثة أشبار و شبرت أسفله فإذا هو اثنا عشر شبرا

A number of our people have narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn Khalid from his father from Muhammad ibn Sinan from al- Hassan al-Sayqal who has said the following: "Abu 'Abd Allah, 'Alayhi al-Salam, once asked me, 'Do you like to see the shirt of 'Amir al- Mu'minin, Ali, 'Alayhi al-Salam in which he sustained the injury, to show his blood (stain)?' I replied, 'Yes, I like to see it.' He (the Imam) asked for it and it was brought in a basket. **He (the Imam) opened and spread it out and it was a shirt made of cotton similar to those of al-Sunbalaniy (a place in Rome) and from the spot for its pocket down to the ground there was a white blood mark like the strike of a sword. He (the Imam) said, 'This is the shirt of Ali, 'Alayhi al-Salam, in which he was mortally wounded and these are the traces of his blood**.' I measured it around his body; it was three shibr and around its bottom it was twelve shibr (the space between the tip of thump and the small finger when they are opened and stretched." [49]

[49] Imam White Blood

Argument 9: Abu Bakr and Umar Buried Next To Muhammad ﷺ

Argument:

“Abu bakr and Umar are buried next to **Prophet Muhammad** ﷺ; therefore, according to this Shia hadith, they are in paradise:

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنِ ابْنِ فَضَّالٍ عَنْ جَمِيلٍ عَنْ أَبِي بَكْرٍ الْحَضْرَمِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ الله (عَلَيْهِ السَّلاَم) قَالَ قَالَ رَسُولُ الله (صلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِه) مَا بَيْنَ بَيْتِي وَمِنْبَرِي رَوْضَةٌ مِنْ رِيَاضِ الْجَنَّةِ وَمِنْبَرِي عَلَى تُرْعَةٍ مِنْ تُرَعِ الْجَنَّةِ وَقَوَائِمُ مِنْبَرِي رُبَّتْ فِي الْجَنَّةِ قَالَ قُلْتُ هِيَ رَوْضَةٌ الْيَوْمِ قَالَ نَعَمْ إِنَّهُ لَوْ كُشِفَ الْغِطَاءُ لَرَأَيْتُمْ.

Muhammad ibn Yahya has narrated from, Ahmad ibn Muhammad from ibn Faddal from Jamil from abu Bakr af-Hadramiy who has said the following: “Abu ‘Abd Allah , has said that the Messenger of Allah, O Allah, grant compensation to Muhammad and his family worthy of their services to Your cause, has said, ‘Between my house and my pulpit there is a garden of the gardens of paradise. My pulpit is on a passageway of the passageways of paradise. The legs of my pulpit had grown in paradise.’ I (the narrator) asked abu ‘Abd Allah , ‘Is it a garden today?’ He (the Imam) replied, ‘Yes, it is a garden today. If the curtain is removed, you can see it.’”

Response:

رأيت في بعض المواضع المعتبرة ما صورته : روى شيخ الطائفة في كتاب كشف الحق بسنده مرفوعا عن أبي بصير قال : حججت مع أبي عبد الله عليه السلام حتى إذا زار قبر جده صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم بالمدينة وزرنا معه ، فقال له رجل من بني يقظان : يا بن رسول الله ! إنهم يزعمون أنهم يزورون أبا بكر وعمر في هذه القبة ! ؟ فقال عليه السلام : مه يا أخا يقظان ، إنهم كذبوا فوالله لو نبش قبرهما لوجد في مكانهما سلمان وأبو ذر ، فوالله إنهما أحق بهذا الموضع من غيرهما ، قال أبو بصير : فقلت : يا بن رسول الله ! كيف يكون انتقال الميت ووضع آخر مكانه ؟ فقال عليه السلام : يا أبا محمد ! إن الله عز وجل خلق سبعين ألف ملك يقال لهم : النقالة ، ينتشرون في مشارق الأرض ومغاربها ، فيأخذون أموات العباد ويدفنون كلا منهم مكانا يستحقه ، وأنهم يسلبون جسد الميت عن نعشه ويضعون آخر مكانه من حيث لا يدرون ولا يشعرون.

I have seen in some reliable sources the following narration: (The Shaykh of the group, in his book *Kashf al-Haq*, narrated with an authentic chain of transmission from Abu Basir, who said: "I performed Hajj with Abu Abdullah (peace be upon him), and when we visited the grave of his grandfather, peace be upon him, in Madinah, we visited with him. A man from the Banu Yaqzan approached and said: 'O son of the Messenger of Allah! **They claim they visit Abu Bakr and Umar in this dome!?'. He, peace be upon him, responded: 'Hush, O brother of Yaqzan! They have lied. By Allah, if their graves were exhumed, they would find in their place Salman and Abu Dhar. By Allah, they are more deserving of this place than anyone else.'** Abu Basir said: 'I then said: O son of the Messenger of Allah! How can a dead person be replaced, and another placed in his place?' He, peace be upon him, replied: 'O Abu Muhammad! Allah, the Mighty and Majestic, created seventy thousand angels called the *Naqqalah* (the movers). They spread across the east and the west of the earth, taking the bodies of the deceased and burying each one in a place that suits him. They remove the body from its bier and place another in its place, and this happens without the deceased being aware or feeling it. [50]

[50] فضائل سلمان Scan فضائل سلمان

وأما افتخارهم بدفنه في جوار النبي صلى الله عليه وآله فسيأتي فيه.

وروى في الصراط المستقيم (1) بإسناده عن عاصم بن حميد، عن صفوان عن الصادق عليه السلام: أنهما لم يبيتا معه إلا ليلة ثم نقلا إلى واد في جهنم يقال لها (2): واد الدود.

As for their pride in being buried next to the Prophet ﷺ, this matter will be addressed later.

It is narrated in *Al-Sirat Al-Mustaqim* through his chain from Asim ibn Humaid, from Safwan, from Imam Al-Sadiq (peace be upon him), that they did not remain with him except for one night, then they were transferred to a valley in Hell called **"Wadi Al-Dood" (the Valley of Worms).** [51]

[51] Bihar Al Anwar V30 P527

Argument 10: Zurarah RA Cursed By Imam Jafar AS

Argument:

“Imam Ja'far AS cursed the most notable Shia narrator, Zurarah (RA); therefore, Shia Islam is false.”

Response:

عن عبد الله بن زرارة ، قال، قال لى ابو عبد الله (ع
اقرأ منى على والدك السلام، وقل له انى انما اعيبك دفاعاً منى عنك ، فان الناس والعدو يسارعون الى كل من قر بناه وحمدنا مكانه لادخال الأذى فى من نحبه ونقربه، ويرمونه لمحبتنا له وقربه و دنوه منا ، ويرون ادخال الأذى عليه وقتله، ويحمدون كل من عبناه نحن وان نحمد امره، فانما اعيبك لأنك رجل اشتهرت بنا ولميلك الينا، وانت في ذلك مذموم عند الناس غير محمود الأثر لمودتك لنا وبميلك الينا، فاحببت ان اعيبك ليحمدوا امرك في الدين بعيبك ونقصك، ويكون بذلك منا دافع شرهم عنك، يقول الله جل وعز : اما السفينة فكانت المساكين يعملون في

Abdullah bin Zurara said:

Abu Abdullah (peace be upon him) said to me:

"Convey my greetings to your father and tell him that I only criticize you as a means of protecting you. For people and the enemy hasten to harm anyone we bring close and praise, seeking to inflict harm upon those we love and draw near to us. They accuse them because of their love for us and their proximity to us, and they see it as justified to harm and even kill them. Meanwhile, they praise those whom we criticize, and they approve of their deeds.

I criticize you because you have become known for your association with us and your inclination toward us. Because of this, you are condemned by the people and not held in good regard due to your affection for us and your leaning toward us. So, I wished to criticize you so that they would approve of you in religious matters through my criticism of you and my apparent disparagement of you, and in doing so, I would be protecting you from their harm.

Allah, the Almighty and Glorious, says: *'As for the ship, it belonged to poor people working at sea, so I intended to damage it because there was a king behind them who seized every [good] ship by force.'* (Qur’an 18:79)." [52]

When it comes to his virtues which are **mass transmitted and sahih** by chain they can be found in Mu'jam al-Ahadith al-Mu'tabarah Volume 1 starting at page 135[53].

Examples:

[160/52] Hamduwayh bin Naseer narrated: Ya'qub bin Yazid and Muhammad bin Al-Hussein bin Abi Al-Khattab narrated to me, from Muhammad bin Abi Umayr, from Ibrahim bin Abdul Hamid and others, who said: **"Abu Abdullah (peace be upon him) said, 'May Allah have mercy on Zurarah bin A'yin. Were it not for Zurarah (bin A'yin) and those like him, the narrations of my father (peace be upon him) would have been lost.'"**[54]

---

[52] Rijal Kashi
[53] Mu'jam al-Ahadith al-Mu'tabarah
[54] Mu'jam al-Ahadith al-Mu'tabarah

[2/158] Rijal al-Kashshi: Hamduwayh b. Nusayr from Ya`qub b. Yazid from Muhammad b. Abi Umayr from Jamil b. Darraj who said: I heard Aba Abdillah عليه السلام say: **Give glad tidings of paradise to the humble:** Burayd b. Muawiya al-Ijli, Abu Basir Layth b. al-Bukhtari al-Muradi, Muhammad b. Muslim and **Zurara.** Four possessors of nobility and the trustees of Allah upon his Halal and Haram, if it wasn't for them the traces of prophethood would have perished and been destroyed. [55]

[55] Muʿjam al-Aḥādīth al-Muʿtabarah

Argument 11: Imam Ali AS Two Years Younger Than Allah SWT

Argument: Ali (peace be upon him said) said: "I am two years younger than my Lord."[56]

Refute:

The source is mursal (a hadith with an incomplete chain of transmission) and lacks an isnad (chain of narrators), which is also due to the fact that Masabih Al-Anwar was published around the year 1246 AH (after the Hijrah), making it a very late and secondary source. It is not found in any of the primary sources.

Sheikh Ghulaam Reza also agrees, stating that he has not found any source for this hadith.[57]

There's also an explanation found in the same page which tries to explain this rather fabricated report:

It was stated: "This meaning is alluded to in the saying of Imam Ali (peace be upon him): 'I am two years younger than my Lord'." Here, the term "Lord" refers to the one who nurtures or raises (murabbi), which is the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him).[58]

[56] Bihar al-Anwar
[57] https://imgur.com/a/TqxkqXA
[58] Tafsir Sirat Al-Mustaqim

Argument 12: Surah Al-Fath Refutes Infallibilty Of Prophet Muhammad ﷺ

Argument:

إِنَّا فَتَحْنَا لَكَ فَتْحًا مُّبِينًا ١
لِّيَغْفِرَ لَكَ ٱللَّهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِن ذَنۢبِكَ وَمَا تَأَخَّرَ وَيُتِمَّ نِعْمَتَهُۥ عَلَيْكَ وَيَهْدِيَكَ صِرَٰطًا مُّسْتَقِيمًا ٢

Indeed, We have granted you a clear triumph ˹O Prophet˺
so that **Allah may forgive you for your past and future shortcomings**, perfect His favour upon you, guide you along the Straight Path,

Response:

ويؤيده: ما روي مرفوعاً عن أبي الحسن الثالث أنه سئل عن قـول الله
عزّ وجلّ: لِيَغْفِرَ لَكَ اللَّهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ذَنْبِكَ وَ مَا تَأَخَّرَ فقال :
وأي ذنب كان لرسول الله الله متقدماً أو متأخراً ؟
وإنما حمله الله ذنوب شيعة علي الله ممن مضى منهم ومن بقي، ثم غفرها الله له

And it is supported by what has been narrated as a *marfu'* (elevated) report from Abu al-Hasan the Third (Imam Ali al-Hadi), who was asked about the saying of Allah, the Almighty:

"That Allah may forgive for you what preceded of your sin and what will follow."

He replied: *"And what sin did the Messenger of Allah, past or future, ever have?* ***Rather, Allah burdened him with the sins of the followers of Ali—those who had passed and those who remained—then He forgave them for him."*** [59]

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنِ ابْنِ فَضَّالٍ عَنِ ابْنِ بُكَيْرٍ قَالَ سَأَلْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ الله (عَلَيهِ السَّلام) فِي قَوْلِ الله عَزَّ وَجَلَّ وَما أَصابَكُمْ مِنْ مُصِيبَةٍ فَبِما كَسَبَتْ أَيْدِيكُمْ فَقَالَ هُوَ وَيَعْفُوا عَنْ كَثِيرٍ قَالَ قُلْتُ لَيْسَ هَذَا أَرَدْتُ أَ رَأَيْتَ مَا أَصَابَ عَلِيّاً وَأَشْبَاهَهُ مِنْ أَهْلِ بَيْتِهِ (عَلَيهِم السَّلام) مِنْ ذَلِكَ فَقَالَ إِنَّ رَسُولَ الله (صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وآلِه) كَانَ يَتُوبُ إِلَى الله فِي كُلِّ يَوْمٍ سَبْعِينَ مَرَّةً مِنْ غَيْرِ ذَنْبٍ.

I asked Abu Abdullah (peace be upon him) about the saying of Allah, the Almighty:

"And whatever misfortune befalls you, it is because of what your hands have earned, but He pardons much." (Surah Ash-Shura 42:30)

He (peace be upon him) replied: *"Yes, and He pardons much."*

I said: *"That is not what I meant. What do you say about what befell Ali and others like him from his family (peace be upon them)?"* He (peace be upon him) said: *"**Indeed, the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) used to repent to Allah seventy times a day, without having committed any sin."*** [60]

---

[59] Tafsir Surah Fath
[60] Al Kafi V2

وروى الحميري في قرب الإسناد عن ابن بكير قال : سألت أبا عبد الله عليه‌السلام عن قول الله عز وجل : « وَما أَصابَكُمْ مِنْ مُصِيبَةٍ فَبِما كَسَبَتْ أَيْدِيكُمْ » فقال : هو « وَيَعْفُوا عَنْ كَثِيرٍ » قال : قلت : ما أصاب عليا وأشياعه من أهل بيته من ذلك؟ قال : فقال : إن رسول الله صلى‌الله‌عليه‌وآله‌وسلم كان يتوب إلى الله عز وجل كل يوم سبعين مرة من غير ذنب.

Al-Himyari narrated in *Qurb al-Isnad* from Ibn Bukayr, who said:

I asked Abu Abdullah (peace be upon him) about the saying of Allah, the Almighty:

"And whatever misfortune befalls you, it is because of what your hands have earned." (Surah Ash-Shura 42:30)

He (peace be upon him) replied: *"It is followed by: 'And He pardons much.'"*

I said: *"What about what befell Ali and his followers from his family in this regard?"*

He (peace be upon him) said: *"Indeed, the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) used to repent to Allah, the Almighty, seventy times every day without having committed any sin."* [61]

[61] Mirat Al-Uqool

Argument 13: Allah Created Adam In His Image

Argument:

“Shias affirm Tajseem because Allah SWT Created Adam in His Image”

Response:

- حدثنا علي بن أحمد بن عبد الله بن أحمد بن أبي عبد الله البرقي الله ، عن أبيه ، عن جده أحمد بن أبي عبد الله ، عن أبيه ، عن عبد الله بن بحر ، عن أبي أيوب الخزار ، عن محمد بن مسلم ، قال : سألت أبا جعفر الا عما يروون أنَّ اللهَ عَزَّ وجلَّ خلق آدم على صورته) فقال : هي صورة محدثة مخلوقة ، اصطفاها الله واختارها على سائر الصور المختلفة ، فأضافها إلى نفسه كما أضاف الكعبة إلى نفسه والروح إلى نفسه . فقال : (بيتي) (١) وقال : ونفخت فيه من روحي).

Ali ibn Ahmad ibn Abdullah ibn Ahmad ibn Abi Abdullah al-Barqi narrated from his father, from his grandfather Ahmad ibn Abi Abdullah, from his father, from Abdullah ibn Bahr, from Abu Ayyub al-Khazzar, from Muhammad ibn Muslim, who said:

I asked Abu Ja‘far (peace be upon him) about what is narrated regarding the saying: *"Indeed, Allah, the Almighty, created Adam in His image."*

He (peace be upon him) replied: ***"It is a created and originated image that Allah selected and chose over all other diverse forms.*** *He attributed it to Himself just as He attributed the Kaaba to Himself and the soul to Himself."*

Then he (peace be upon him) said: *"He said, 'My House' (referring to the Kaaba), and He said, 'And I breathed into him from My Spirit.'”* [62]

[62] Nur Al Barahin

Argument 14: Abu Bakr and Umar Compared To Prophets

Argument:

10 - أمالي الطوسي: أبو عمرو، عن أحمد، عن أحمد بن يحيى، عن عبد الرحمن (1)، عن أبيه، عن الأعمش، عن عمرو بن مرة، عن أبي عبيدة، عن عبد الله بن مسعود أنه قال: لما كان يوم بدر وأسرت الاسرى قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: ما ترون في هؤلاء القوم؟ فقال عمر بن الخطاب: يا رسول الله هم الذين كذبوك وأخرجوك فاقتلهم، ثم قال أبو بكر: يا رسول الله هم قومك وعشيرتك ولعل الله يستنقذهم بك من النار، ثم قال عبد الله بن رواحة: أنت بواد كثير الحطب، فاجمع حطبا فالهب فيه نارا و ألقهم فيه، فقال العباس بن عبد المطلب: قطعك رحمك، قال: ثم إن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله قام فدخل وأكثر الناس في قول أبي بكر وعمر فقال بعضهم: القول ما قال أبو بكر وقال بعضهم: القول ما قال عمر، فخرج رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله فقال: ما اختلافكم يا أيها الناس في قول هذين الرجلين؟ إنما مثلهما مثل إخوة لهما ممن كان قبلهما: نوح وإبراهيم وموسى وعيسى عليهم السلام، قال نوح: " رب لا تذر على الأرض من الكافرين ديارا (2) " وقال إبراهيم: " من تبعني فإنه مني ومن عصاني فإنك غفور رحيم (3) " وقال موسى: " ربنا اطمس

On the day of Badr, when the captives were taken, the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) said: "What do you think about these people?"

Umar ibn Al-Khattab said: "O Messenger of Allah, they are the ones who denied you and expelled you, so kill them."

Then Abu Bakr said: "O Messenger of Allah, they are your people and your kin, perhaps Allah will save them through you from the Fire."

Then Abdullah ibn Rawahah said: "You are in a valley full of firewood, so gather firewood, ignite it, and throw them into it." At that, Al-Abbas ibn Abdul Muttalib said: "You have severed your ties of kinship!" Then the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) went inside, while most people were supporting either Abu Bakr's or Umar's opinion. Some said: "The correct view is what Abu Bakr said," while others said: "The correct view is what Umar said." Then the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) came out and said: **"Why are you differing over the words of these two men? Their example is like that of two brothers before them: Noah, Abraham, Moses, and Jesus (peace be upon them). Noah said: 'My Lord, do not leave upon the earth any inhabitant among the disbelievers' , and Abraham said: 'Whoever follows me is of me, and whoever disobeys me, indeed You are Forgiving and Merciful' ."**

Response:

Majlisi explains the hadith in next page:

بيان: أثر الوضع في أكثر أجزاء الخبر ظاهر، لا سيما في قوله: مثل إخوة لهما، كما سنوضحه في كتاب الفتن إن شاء الله تعالى .

The effect of fabrication is evident in most parts of the report, especially in his words: 'like two of their brothers', as we will explain in the Book of Tribulations, God willing.[63]

[63] Scan Bihar V19

Argument 15: Allah SWT Places Hand On Imam Hussein AS

Argument:

29 - كامل الزيارة: أبي، عن سعد، عن اليقطيني، عن محمد بن سنان، عن أبي سعيد القماط، عن ابن أبي يعفور، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: بينا رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله في منزل فاطمة والحسين في حجره إذ بكى وخر ساجدا ثم قال: يا فاطمة يا بنت محمد إن العلي الأعلى تراء إلي في بيتك هذا ساعتي هذه في أحسن صورة وأهيأ هيئة وقال لي: يا محمد أتحب الحسين؟ فقلت: نعم قرة عيني، وريحانتي، وثمرة فؤادي، وجلدة ما بين عيني، فقال لي: يا محمد ووضع يده على رأس الحسين بورك من مولود عليه بركاتي وصلواتي ورحمتي ورضواني، ولعنتي وسخطي وعذابي وخزيي ونكالي على من قتله وناصبه وناواه ونازعه، أما إنه سيد الشهداء من الأولين والآخرين في الدنيا والآخرة وسيد شباب أهل الجنة من الخلق أجمعين وأبوه أفضل منه وخير فأقرئه السلام وبشره بأنه راية الهدى، ومنار أوليائي وحفيظي وشهيدي على خلقي وخازن علمي وحجتي على أهل السماوات وأهل الأرضين والثقلين الجن والإنس (2).

While the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) was in the house of Fatima, and Husayn was in his lap, he suddenly wept and fell into prostration. Then he said:

"O Fatima, O daughter of Muhammad! **The Most High and Exalted appeared to me in your house at this very moment in the most beautiful and perfect form. He said to me: 'O Muhammad, do you love Husayn?'**

I replied: 'Yes, he is the delight of my eyes, my fragrance, the fruit of my heart, and the skin between my eyes.'

Then He said to me: 'O Muhammad'—placing His hand on Husayn's head—'Blessed is this newborn, upon whom are My blessings, My prayers, My mercy, and My pleasure. And My curse, My wrath, My punishment, My disgrace, and My torment are upon those who kill him, oppose him, bear hostility toward him, or challenge him. Indeed, he is the master of martyrs from the first to the last, in this world and the hereafter, and the master of the youth of Paradise from all of creation. Yet, his father is greater and better than him. Convey to him My peace and give him glad tidings that he is the banner of guidance, the light for My allies, My trustee, My witness over My creation, the keeper of My knowledge, and My proof upon the inhabitants of the heavens and the earth, as well as both mankind and jinn.'"

Response:

Majlisi explains the "placing of the hand on his head":

بيان: " إن العلي الأعلى " أي رسوله جبرئيل أو يكون الترائي كناية عن غاية الظهور العلمي، وحسن الصورة كناية عن ظهور صفات كماله تعالى له، ووضع اليد كناية عن إفاضة الرحمة.

"Indeed, the Most High and Exalted" refers to His Messenger, Jibril, or the manifestation may be a metaphor for the utmost clarity in knowledge. The phrase **"beautiful form"** is a metaphor for the revelation of His perfect attributes, and **"placing the hand"** symbolizes the outpouring of divine mercy.[64]

[64] Scan Bihar V44

Argument 16: Allah SWT Stregthened Islam With Umar

Argument:

40- عن محمد بن مروان عن أبي عبد الله ع قال قلت له: جعلت فداك قال رسول الله ص: أعز الإسلام بأبي جهل بن هشام أو بعمر بن الخطاب فقال: يا محمد قد و الله قال ذلك، و كان علي أشد من ضرب العنق.

40 - From Muhammad ibn Marwan, from Abu Abdullah (peace be upon him), who said:

I said to him: "May I be your ransom! Did the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) say: ‘Strengthen Islam with Abu Jahl ibn Hisham or with Umar ibn Al-Khattab?’"

He replied: "O Muhammad, by Allah, he did say that, and it was more severe than execution."

Response:

If you read the full hadith, it becomes clear that it is not a statement of virtue but rather a declaration of disbelief (kufr) regarding the individuals mentioned. The hadith recounts that the Prophet (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) made a supplication, but in response, Allah revealed a verse rejecting the idea of taking misleaders as allies.

عن محمد بن مروان عن أبي عبد الله ع قال قلت له: جعلت فداك قال رسول الله ص: أعز الإسلام بأبي جهل بن هشام أو بعمر بن الخطاب فقال: يا محمد قد و الله قال ذلك، و كان علي أشد من ضرب العنق، ثم أقبل علي فقال: هل تدري ما أنزل الله يا محمد قلت: أنت أعلم جعلت فداك، قال: إن رسول الله كان في دار الأرقم فقال: اللهم أعز الإسلام بأبي جهل بن هشام أو بعمر بن الخطاب فأنزل الله «ما أَشْهَدْتُهُمْ خَلْقَ السَّماواتِ وَ الْأَرْضِ وَ لا خَلْقَ أَنْفُسِهِمْ- وَ ما كُنْتُ مُتَّخِذَ الْمُضِلِّينَ عَضُداً» يعنيهما

40 - From Muhammad ibn Marwan, from Abu Abdullah (peace be upon him), who said:

I said to him: “May I be your ransom! Did the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) say: ‘Strengthen Islam with Abu Jahl ibn Hisham or with Umar ibn Al-Khattab?’”

He replied: “O Muhammad, by Allah, he did say that, **and it was more severe than execution.**”

Then he turned to me and said: “Do you know what Allah revealed, O Muhammad?”

I replied: “You are more knowledgeable, may I be your ransom.”

He said: “The Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) was in the house of Al-Arqam when he said: ‘O Allah, strengthen Islam with Abu Jahl ibn Hisham or with Umar ibn Al-Khattab.’ Then Allah revealed:

‘I did not make them witness the creation of the heavens and the earth or the creation of themselves, ***nor would I take the misleaders as assistants.****’* (Surah Al-Kahf 18:51) [65]

[65] Scan Tafsir Ayyashi V3

Argument 17: Allah SWT Visits Imam Hussein On Fridays

Argument:

32 - كامل الزيارة: أبي وأخي وجماعة مشايخي، عن محمد بن يحيى وأحمد بن إدريس معا "، عن حمدان بن سليمان، عن عبد الله بن محمد اليماني، عن منيع بن الحجاج عن يونس، عن صفوان الجمال قال: قال لي أبو عبد الله عليه السلام لما أتى الحيرة: هل لك في قبر الحسين؟ قلت: وتزوره جعلت فداك؟ قال: وكيف لا أزوره والله يزوره في كل ليلة جمعة يهبط مع الملائكة إليه والأنبياء والأوصياء ومحمد أفضل الأنبياء ونحن أفضل الأوصياء.
فقال صفوان: جعلت فداك فنزوره في كل جمعة حتى ندرك زيارة الرب؟
قال: نعم يا صفوان: الزم تكتب لك زيارة قبر الحسين وذلك تفضيل.

Abu Abdullah (peace be upon him) said to me when he arrived at al-Hirah: “Would you like to visit the grave of Husayn?”

I said: “Do you visit it, may I be your ransom?”

He said: **“How could I not visit it, when by Allah, He visits it every Friday night? He descends with the angels, the prophets, the successors, and Muhammad—the best of the prophets. And we are the best of the successors.”**

So Safwan said: **“May I be your ransom! Should we visit him every Friday so that we may attain the visitation of the Lord?”**

He said: “Yes, O Safwan! Be consistent in it, for visiting the grave of Husayn will be recorded for you, and that is a great honor.”

Response

بيان: زيارته تعالى كناية عن إنزال رحماته الخاصة عليه وعلى زائريه صلوات الله عليه (قوله عليه السلام) وذلك تفضيل أي زيارة الرب.

Statement: His (Allah's) visitation is a metaphor for the descent of His special mercy upon him **(Imam Husayn, peace be upon him)** and upon his visitors.

(His saying, peace be upon him:) *"And that is a great honor"* refers to the visitation of the Lord.[66]

[66] Scan Bihar V98

Argument 18: Prophet Fobrade Mutah At Khaybar

Argument:

“The Prophet ‘forbade’ Mutah at Khaybar, yet Shias still practice it.”

Response:

العياشي في (تفسيره): عن محمد بن مسلم، عن أبي جعفر (عليه السلام) قال: قال: جابر بن عبد الله عن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله): أنهم غزوا معه فأحل لهم المتعة ولم يحرمها.

Al-‘Ayyashi, in his Tafsir, narrated from Muhammad ibn Muslim, from Abu Ja‘far (peace be upon him), who said:

Jabir ibn Abdullah reported from ***the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) that they went on an expedition with him, and he permitted them to practice mut‘ah (temporary marriage) and never prohibited it.***[67]

[67] وسائل الشيعة V21

Argument 19: Salman RA Entering Upon Fatima AS

Argument:

سلمان الفارسي قال:

فهرولت إلى منزل فاطمة (عليها السلام) بنت محمد (صلى الله عليه وآله)، فإذا هي جالسة وعليها قطعة عباء، إذا خمرت رأسها انجلى ساقها، وإذا غطت ساقها انكشف رأسها. فلما نظرت إلي اعتجرت ثم قالت:

"يا سلمان، جفوتني بعد وفاة أبي (صلى الله عليه وآله)."

Salman al-Farsi said:
So I hurried to the house of Fatima (peace be upon her), the daughter of Muhammad (peace and blessings be upon him and his family), and found her sitting with a piece of cloth. **If she covered her head with it, her legs were exposed, and if she covered her legs, her head was uncovered. When she saw me, she veiled herself and said:**

"O Salman, you have been distant from me since my father's passing (peace and blessings be upon him and his family)."

Response:

We read in Surah An-Nur Ayah 31:

وَقُل لِّلْمُؤْمِنَاتِ يَغْضُضْنَ مِنْ أَبْصَارِهِنَّ وَيَحْفَظْنَ فُرُوجَهُنَّ وَلَا يُبْدِينَ زِينَتَهُنَّ إِلَّا مَا ظَهَرَ مِنْهَا ۖ وَلْيَضْرِبْنَ بِخُمُرِهِنَّ عَلَىٰ جُيُوبِهِنَّ وَلَا يُبْدِينَ زِينَتَهُنَّ إِلَّا لِبُعُولَتِهِنَّ أَوْ آبَائِهِنَّ أَوْ آبَاءِ بُعُولَتِهِنَّ أَوْ أَبْنَائِهِنَّ أَوْ أَبْنَاءِ بُعُولَتِهِنَّ أَوْ إِخْوَانِهِنَّ أَوْ بَنِي إِخْوَانِهِنَّ أَوْ بَنِي أَخَوَاتِهِنَّ أَوْ نِسَائِهِنَّ أَوْ مَا مَلَكَتْ أَيْمَانُهُنَّ أَوِ التَّابِعِينَ غَيْرِ أُولِي الْإِرْبَةِ مِنَ الرِّجَالِ أَوِ الطِّفْلِ الَّذِينَ لَمْ يَظْهَرُوا عَلَىٰ عَوْرَاتِ النِّسَاءِ ۖ وَلَا يَضْرِبْنَ بِأَرْجُلِهِنَّ لِيُعْلَمَ مَا يُخْفِينَ مِن زِينَتِهِنَّ ۚ وَتُوبُوا إِلَى اللَّهِ جَمِيعًا أَيُّهَ الْمُؤْمِنُونَ لَعَلَّكُمْ تُفْلِحُونَ

And tell the believing women to lower their gaze and guard their chastity and not expose their adornment except that which [necessarily] appears thereof and to wrap [a portion of] their headcovers over their chests and ***not expose their adornment except to their husbands, their fathers, their husbands' fathers, their sons, their husbands' sons, their brothers, their brothers' sons, their sisters' sons, their women, that which their right hands possess, or those male attendants having no physical desire, or children who are not yet aware of the private aspects of women.*** *And let them not stamp their feet to make known what they conceal of their adornment. And turn to Allah in repentance, all of you, O believers, that you might succeed."* [68]

[68] Surah An-Nur 31

Salman RA was an old man with no desires. It is hypocritical for some Sunnis to mock this hadith when their own sources contain similar narrations:

حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عِيسَى، حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو جُمَيْعٍ، سَالِمُ بْنُ دِينَارٍ عَنْ ثَابِتٍ، عَنْ أَنَسٍ، أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صلى الله عليه وسلم أَتَى فَاطِمَةَ بِعَبْدٍ قَدْ وَهَبَهُ لَهَا قَالَ وَعَلَى فَاطِمَةَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا ثَوْبٌ إِذَا قَنَّعَتْ بِهِ رَأْسَهَا لَمْ يَبْلُغْ رِجْلَيْهَا وَإِذَا غَطَّتْ بِهِ رِجْلَيْهَا لَمْ يَبْلُغْ رَأْسَهَا فَلَمَّا رَأَى النَّبِيُّ صلى الله عليه وسلم مَا تَلْقَى قَالَ " إِنَّهُ لَيْسَ عَلَيْكِ بَأْسٌ إِنَّمَا هُوَ أَبُوكِ وَغُلاَمُكِ "

The Prophet (ﷺ) brought Fatimah a slave which he donated to her. **Fatimah wore a garment which, when she covered her head, did not reach her feet, and when she covered her feet by it, that garment did not reach her head.** When the Prophet (ﷺ) saw her struggle, he said: There is no harm to you: Here is only your father and slave. [69]

[69] Sunan Abi Dawud 4106

Argument 20: Shia Prophet Was Bewitched

Argument:

“Shia Prophet is bewitched”

Response:

Allama Majlisi explains the ahadith regarding The Prophet being bewitched:

وأما تأثير السحر في النبي والإمام - صلوات الله عليهما - فالظاهر عدم وقوعه وإن لم يقم برهان على امتناعه إذا لم ينته إلى حد يخل بغرض البعثة، كالتخبيط والتخليط، فإنه إذا كان الله سبحانه أقدر الكفار لمصالح التكليف على حبس الأنبياء والأوصياء عليهم السلام وضربهم وجرحهم وقتلهم بأشنع الوجوه فأي استحالة على أن يقدروا على فعل يؤثر فيهم هما ومرضا؟
لكن لما عرفت أن السحر يندفع بالعوذ والآيات والتوكل، وهم عليهم السلام معادن جميع ذلك، فتأثيره فيهم مستبعد، والأخبار الواردة في ذلك أكثرها عامية أو ضعيفة ومعارضة بمثلها، فيشكل التعويل عليها في إثبات مثل ذلك.

As for the effect of sorcery on the Prophet and the Imam—peace be upon them—the apparent view is that it did not occur, although there is no definitive proof that it is impossible, as long as it does not reach a level that would undermine the purpose of their mission, such as causing confusion or irrational behavior. For if Allah, the Almighty, has enabled disbelievers, for the sake of testing and accountability, to imprison the prophets and their successors, to strike, wound, and even kill them in the most horrific ways, then what would make it impossible for them to afflict them with distress or illness through sorcery? **However, since it is known that sorcery can be countered by prayers, Quranic verses, and reliance on Allah, and since the Prophets and Imams are the very sources of these means, it is highly unlikely that magic would affect them. Moreover, most of the narrations regarding this matter come from Sunni sources or are weak and contradicted by similar reports, making it difficult to rely on them as evidence for such claims.** [70]

Sheikh al Tusi, in his book Al-Tibyan, said: "It is not permissible for the Prophet (peace be upon him) to have been bewitched as narrated by ignorant storytellers, because whoever is described as being bewitched has had their mind disturbed, and Allah, the Exalted, has denied this in His statement: 'And the wrongdoers say, "You are only following a man who is bewitched."' However, it is possible that some of the Jews attempted to do so but were unable to succeed. Then, Allah informed His Prophet of what they had done, until he uncovered their deception. This served as evidence of his truthfulness and as a miracle for him." [71]

---

[70] Prophet Bewitched Explained
[71] Al-Tibyan - Sheikh Al-Tusi - Vol. 10 - Page 434